Unconventional Superconductivity: **Overview and Planar Tunneling** Planar Tunneling into a Kondo Lattice

Laura H Greene

Electron

- National MagLab (FSU-UF-LANL) & Florida State University
- **IUPAP Vice President for Ethics and Outreach**
- President's Council of Advisors on Science & Technology (PCAST)

Ihgreene@magnet.fsu.edu



Outline

- PCAST: President's Council of Advisors for Science and technology
- The National MagLab (NHMFL)
- Overview of *Unconventional* Superconductivity
- Dark Energy of Quantum Materials: A Fun Analogy
- Planar Tunneling Spectroscopy
- Harrison's theorem: Planar tunneling detects NFLs
- f-level paring in a heavy fermion superconductor
- Conclusion: I'm around all week let's chat!





PCAST: Appointed by Joe Biden, 2022 They only pay us in pictures and bragging rights



WH East Wing: Signing of the EO on Al

Recently in the West Wing³

March 24, 2022



PCAST Consensus REPORTS (19 in total) https://www.whitehouse.gov/pcast/documents-reports/

In Progress:

- Social and Behavioral Sciences
- Groundwater
- Nutrition
- Vibrancy of Basic Research
- Federal STEM Workforce

Published in 2024

- Report on Recommendations for Supercharging Research: Harnessing Artificial Intelligence to Meet Global Challenges. Co-Chair with Terrence Tao.
- Joint Statement to Leaders from PCAST and the United Kingdom's Prime Minister's Council for Science and Technology
- Report on Recommendations for Strategy for Cyber-Physical Resilience
- Report on Recommendations for Accelerating Effective Reduction of Greenhouse Gas Emissions



PCAST REPORTS

Published in 2023

- Report on Recommendations for A Transformational Effort on Patient Safety
- Letter on Recommendations for Advancing Public Engagement with the Sciences
- Report on Recommendations for the National Nanotechnology Initiative
- Report on Recommendations for Supporting the U.S. Public Health Workforce
- Report on Recommendations for Enhancing Prediction and Protecting
 Communities Against Extreme Weather Risk
- Report on Recommendations for Modernizing Wildland Firefighting

Published in 2024

- Report on Recommendations for Strengthening U.S. Biomanufacturing
- Report on Recommendations for Semiconductors R&D
- Letter on Recommendations for Semiconductors R&D
- Exploratory Group on Innovation, Competitiveness, and Hubs. Co-Chair (With Andrea Goldsmith) (Internal Report: unpublished)



My course this semester: Science Literacy: Mis vs Dis - Information

This survey course addresses aspects of scientific literacy including the importance of scientific method and defining traditional scientific misconduct in the US. We will discuss how to identify pathological science, premeditated fraud, and cases that fall between those extremes. These extremes **map onto what we more** recently, and more generally, identify as misinformation and **disinformation**. In enhancing science literacy, we will discuss how to read and write a scientific paper and tour scientific facilities such as the MagLab and the John D Fox Nuclear Laboratory at FSU. We will also discuss how responsible use of AI can enhance our science literacy and supercharge scientific research.



NATIONAL HIGH AGNETIC FIELD LABORATORY



Mission (1990-present)



- Operate a world-leading high-magnetic-field user program
- Carry out in-house research in support of the user program
- Maintain facility and develop new magnets/instrumentation
- **Conduct education and outreach activities**

21.1 T / 105 mm NMR





21 T / 123 mm ICR 45 T hybrid magnet 101 T pulsed fields







National High Magnetic





1.4 GW Generator

Los Alamos National Laboratory



101T Pulse Magnet 10mm bore







Florida State University

45T Hybrid **DC Magnet**

University of Florida

Advanced Magnetic Resonance Imaging and Spectroscopy Facility (MRI up to 21.1 T)





High B/T Facility 17T at 0.5mK







900MHz, 105mm bore 21T NMR/MRI Magnet

The MagLab attracts High Magnetic Field Research from Around The World

Yearly, we host: ~ 2000 users from ~ 200 institutions across the United States...



...and ~300 institutions internationally. Helped train 250 postdocs 550 graduate students > 400 refereed publications.

Newcomers are welcome: 25% Principal Investigators are first-time MagLab users!



Unique Infrastructure and World-Record Magnets Enable the Scientific Productivity

Some Hits:

2017	2017	2017	2018	2020
36 T Series Connected Hybrid (1.5 GHz NMR and 1.0THz EMR)	41.5 T / 34 MW resistive magnet	32 T HTS/LTS ALL superconducting	45.5 T HTS test coil	77 T duplex pulsed magnet (capacitor-bank-driven)
		THE CHARTER HERE THE CHARTER THE CHARTER HERE THE CHARTER THE THE CHARTER THE CHARTER THE	estimation of the second se	77T Duplex Workhorse 65T Wugge

Three World-Record User Magnets Commissioned in One Year Proof-of-Principle that HTS/LTS Magnets can go beyond 32T.

2021: NSF funded 40T superconducting magnet design Complex decade-long basic research and design

Ĥ

 ~ 100

National MagLab magnet recognized with R&D 100 award

32 T all-superconducting magnet user facility



32 tesla superconducting magnet recognized with R&D 100 award



World's strongest superconducting magnet celebrated as a top 100 revolutionary technology.



Some Science Highlights



200 300 400 500 600 700 800 900 Mass in Dalton (a.m.u.)

FIELD LABORATORY









Materials Example: Complex Superconducting Phase Diagrams

Phase diagram of the heavy-fermion superconductor UTe₂ : Three superconducting phases: one **Completely new and intriguing superconducting state**:



The **re-entrant ("Lazarus") superconducting phase (green) appears in a polarized state, suggesting spin-triplet SC** desirable for topological quantum computing (Sheng et al 2019)

DC and Pulsed User Facilities

Materials Example: Possible Quantum Spin Liquid Honeycomb lattice Na₂Co₂TeO₆ Coupling *via* cobalt spins

To look for evidence of the sought-after spin liquid state, investigate the magnetic excitations and elucidate the spin-structure of the $Na_2Co_2TeO_6$ a large suite of measurement techniques are needed.



Zhang, S.; Lee, S.; Woods, A.J.; Peria, W.K.; Thomas, S.M.; Movshovich, R.; Brosha, E.; Huang, Q.; Zhou, H.; Zapf, V.; Lee, M., *Electronic and magnetic phase diagrams of the Kitaev quantum spin liquid candidate* Na₂Co₂TeO₆, Phys Rev B **108**, 064421 (2023).



L. Xiang, R. Dhakal, M. Ozerov, Y. Jiang, B S. Mou, A. Ozarowski, Q. Huang, H. Zhou, J. Fang, S. M. Winter, Z. Jiang, and D. Smirnov, *Disordered-enriched magnetic excitations in a Heisenberg-Kitaev Quantum Magnet Na*₂*Co*₂*TeO*₆, *PRL* **131**, 076701 (2023). ¹⁶

$\vec{\mathsf{M}}$

Materials Example: THz Spin Pumping into Antiferromagnet: Spin-Charge Interconversion



Comparison of electrical signals for different circular polarizations



- First observation of THz radiation pumping spinpolarized current from an <u>antiferromagnet</u> into an adjacent non-magnetic metal.
- Then conversion into ultrafast electrical signals, 2-3 orders of magnitude faster than ferromagnetic devices.
- Important for development of <u>high-efficiency spintronics</u> <u>devices</u> operating at high speeds/frequencies.

Vaidya *et al*., Science **368**, 160 (2020)

Electron Magnetic Resonance (EMF) User Facility

FIELD LABORATORY









Energy : Ion Cyclotron Resonance (ICR)



21 T high-homogeneity wide-bore magnet, 1 part-per-ten billion mass resolution Petroleum, metabolic, and organic compounds

Petroleomics:

- Did BP and Exxon strike the same well in the Gulf (drill cost ~ \$1B/ea)
- Where did a spill originate?
 (Forensics)

Proteomics:

- Identify PROTEIN
 FOLDING through H-D
 exchange: Identified
 p53 registrations to
 classify malignant/non malignant
- Protein makeups

Climate Change & Sustainability:

- Identify soluble vs insoluble carbon compounds; and other structures.
- Classifying carbon in the arctic permafrost
- Plastics & PFAS breakdown

Sustainability: ICR to Study Dissolved Organic Matter (DOM):

Molecular-Level Signatures of the Changing Arctic and the Built Planet



What controls DOM composition in space and time in the Arctic?

- Arctic Great Rivers Observatory
- 6 rivers, 6 years, 6 samples/year captures seasonality (across the highly dynamic hydrograph)
- Insights from FT-ICR MS and carbon isotopes (stable and radiocarbon)

PFAS in Groundwater: EPA test for a few of them where there are hundreds of thousands of distinct PFAS species that ICR can identify



Water-Insoluble tar

Water-Soluble Compounds



Ion Cyclotron Resonance User Facility

Sustainability: ICR finds Sunlight converts plastics into complex chemical mixtures: Emerging control of Plastic Photochemical Fate in Oceans





- Studied photochemical breakdown of shopping bags from Target, Walmart, CVS, and pure polyethylene.
- Found *plastics are NOT inert* in the environment and sunlight can chemically transform plastics into a diverse suite of *new compounds with unknown fates and impacts*.

Walsh et al., Envi Sci & Tech (2021)

Ion Cyclotron Resonance User Facility





FIELD LABORATORY



Advanced Magnetic Resonance Imaging & Spectroscopy (AMRIS) UF, Gainesville, and NMR FSU. Tallahassee

Life Example I **MRI goes High-Definition 21 T on Hydrogen** (Commercial now 2 – 4 T)

Present state-of-the-ant Rat neuron: 10µm dia



First single cell imaged....Frog ovum: 1mm dia Million to one decrease in voxel size over the past 20 years

> Sub-cellular structures are now able to be imaged: a few *microns* on a side!





Mag Lab Life Example II: High-Definition MRI

At 21 Tesla: the earliest detection of plaque amyloids, for Alzheimer's on the planet



50 μm isotropic resolution images from wildtype and diseased brains on our 900

Detecting microhemorrhages



Mag Lab Life Example III: MRI Across the Periodic Table Imaging Sodium in Living Mouse Brain at 21 T

Before Chemotherapy

4 Days After



The 'lighting up' of the tumor indicates the chemotherapy may be working



Mag Lab Life Example IV: Magnetic Quantum Dots for Live Stem Cell Tracking: *In-vivo* at 17.6 T

Living stem cells labeled with Gd nanoparticles tracked *in vivo* using MRI in a living mouse brain as they respond to brain damage resulting from a stroke.



The Dark Energy of Quantum Materials *Why this title?* (public engagement and my view from 35k)

Quantum Materials: *Many* unsolved questions that are no less fundamental than those in **Cosmology** (Gravity Waves to Dark Energy & Dark Matter)



Colliding Black Holes create: Gravity waves across the universe. 10²⁶ meters - (10⁴⁹ Watts)

Quantum Materials -Electrons form "clumps." 10⁻¹⁰ meters - (10⁻²¹ Watts)

Difference: 10³⁶ in length and (10⁷⁰ in power)!



Discovery of <u>Unconventional</u>

Superconductivity: 1979 Frank Steglich in Heavy-fermions.



In Köln – nearby here! Gil Lonzarich discovers "Domed" phase diagram with a possible magnetic quantum critical point: a signature of unconventional SC



=> BCS Electron-phonon pairing cannot be entire mechanism





29



Canonical Domed Phase Diagram



Ubiquitous Phase diagram: At least 50 families of Unconventional SCs



0.02

0.04

-b 06

0.08

0.10

lectron Matter

20 40 60

Pressure/khar

Intriguing Point About The Dome



- 1. ~ All High-Tc SCs are Unconventional
- 2. ~ All Unconventional SCs have Quantum Matter
- 3. Quantum Matter Suppresses Tc
- 4. But you don't get HTS without it
 - => Some kind of delicate balance!



So I study quantum matter...

Some Examples of Electron Matter: Non-Fermi Liquid (NFL) Behavior C4 symmetry breaking; static or fluctuating:

Electronic Nematicity 28 kbar (WD Cril) 20 -**Heavy Electrons** emperature (K) 20 **Stripes** T^{1.2} (K^{1.2}) **CDWs in Cuprates** superconducting state Pseudogap in Cuprates C2 el's Pressure (kbar) T-dep CDW's in TM-oxides lattice Quantum critical fluctuations Ba(Fe1-,Cox)2As 2nd order PM \$ 100 aramagneti Tetragonal FM Orthorhombi TCP 50 Antiferromagnetic Orthorhombi erconducting OCP 12

OCP

1st order (wings)

Ubiquitous Phase Diagram

Co Doping %

MANY techniques have been developed to study quantum matter, including:

STM ARPES (+spin, THz...) RIXS Quantum Oscillations Terahertz New ultra-sensitive transport, optical... In High Mag Fields Point Contact Planar Tunneling And a lot more...

Combinng all these new **Mesurement techniques**

- + Growth
- + Computation = Knowledge & understanding



Unsolved Quantum Matter

Solved:

- Fermi Liquids (i.e., simple metal) : General electronic structure calculations work well (from crystal components and structure)
- **Superconductors** (one of 3 solved quantum materials): All have Cooper pairs, so Bogolioubov-de Gennes equations (BdG) work well.

General definitions for Unsolved QM:

- **Theory**: The electronic properties can**not** be explained by the crystal structure and atoms
- **Experiment:** The electron-electron interaction is stronger than the electron-lattice interaction: Electron fluid has a lower symmetry than underlying lattice.



Conventional Superconductors

Tc typically ≤ 40 K (at easily attainable pressures)

High Temp: Fermi Liquid



Low Temp: Superconducting Cooper pairs





Conventional Superconductors

Tc typically ≤ 40 K (at easily attainable pressures)



High Temp: Fermi Liquid

Low Temp: Superconducting Cooper pairs





Unconventional Superconductors

Tc ≤ 165 K "Domed" phase diagram



Above Tc: FAR RIGHT side of phase diag: Simple metal

Below Tc: Cooper pairs



JO2 ∝ √E

Above Tc: Quantum Matter





Unconventional Superconductors







Recent Inspiration: Gravity







Rainer Weiss Barry C. Barish Kip S. Thorne

"for derivine contributions to the LIGO detector and the observation of gravitational sources"



Quantum Matter









The Gravity Wave Detector: LIGO



Energy was more than the combined power of all light radiated by all the stars in the observable universe!

Many Quantum Matter Detectors









Quantum Matter

Two Great Unsolved Problems in Physics

PROGRESS	Gravity	Quantum Matter	PROGRESS
Forces between objects derived from mass and positions	Newtonian -Classical	Simple metals	Properties derived from crystal atoms and positions
Masses create distortions in background (space-time continuum)	Einsteinian -General Relativity	BCS SC -One Electron Matter solved!	Electrons create distortions in background (crystal lattice)
UNSOLVED: May show how stars formetc.	Dark Energy and Dark Matter	Electron Matter (correlations)	UNSOLVED: All unconv SCs have them

Electron Tunneling



Fermi's Golden Rule

 $\Gamma_{i \to f} = \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} \left| \left\langle f \left| H' \right| i \right\rangle \right|^2 \rho$ DoS or N(E)



Electron Tunneling Spectroscopy: DoS



Conductance Reveals the "<u>Tunneling</u> Density of States"



 $\frac{N_n(E)}{N_n(E_F)} = \left(\frac{E}{E_F}\right)^{1/2} \qquad \qquad \frac{N_s(E)}{N_n(E_F)} = \begin{cases} \frac{E}{\left(E^2 - \Delta^2\right)^{1/2}} & (E > \Delta) \\ 0 & (E < \Delta) \end{cases}$

Harrison's theorem (1961) Let's discuss during the week!



Planar tunneling conductance for small bias: $\frac{dI}{dV} \propto \int dk \ v_k \ \text{Im} \ G(k, eV)$

For simple metals (weak correlations)

,
$$\operatorname{Im} G(k, eV) = \delta(\varepsilon_k - eV)$$

ImG(k, eV) = the imaginary
part of the Green's function:
The Spectral function



Therefore, above T_c, planar tunneling gives ohm's law: flat, featureless conductance.

Why do we see the superconducting tunneling detect the DoS?

These two slides are on how Planar Tunneling Spectroscopy reveals non-Fermi liquid behavior



Fermi's Golden Rule

$$\Gamma_{i \to f} = \frac{2\pi}{\hbar} \left| \left\langle f \left| H' \right| i \right\rangle \right|^2 \rho$$

Tunneling current can be derived as:

$$\mathbf{J} = -\frac{2\pi e\tau}{\hbar} \sum_{i,f} \int_{\mathrm{BZ}} \frac{d\mathbf{k}}{(2\pi)^D} |\mathbf{v}_i - \mathbf{v}_f| (f_i(\mathbf{k}) - f_f(\mathbf{k})) |H'_{if}|^2 \delta(E_f(\mathbf{k}) - E_i(\mathbf{k}) - \hbar\omega),$$

Fermi velocity Density of states

v_F ~dE/dk and N(E) ~ dk/dE: they divide out for a FL!

- Q: Why do we see the SC gap, electronic nematicity, Kondo effects....?
- A: They are not Fermi Liquids!



Let's discuss during the week!

Electronic Nematic Phase (NFL)





Nematic phase in liquid crystal Electronic nematic phase: Fermi Surface distortion by orbital ordering



Summary PCS raw data Ba(Fe_{1-x}Co_x)₂As₂



Another example of NFL being detected



CeColn₅ Introduction and Motivation

Heavy Fermion Superconductivity and Non-Fermi Liquid behavior High $T_c = 2.3$ K (for a heavy fermion superconductor)





CeCoIn₅ DoS along major crystallographic directions



H = 0.2 T applied field => Pb normal T = 20 mK

(001) and (100): Sharp coherence peaks $\Delta = 0.6$ meV at T = 0.4 K.

(110) Split ZBCP: Andreev Bound States??? Masked due to broad peak from Kondo resonance.

=> More spectroscopic proof of d_{x2-y2} symmetry

d-wave BTK fit: Delta



Delta - Gamma - Z (001): 0.66 meV - 042 meV - 2.28 (100): 0.54 meV - 0.198 meV 1.21 Roundness in (001) explained by tunneling cone effect.



T-Dependence of Junctions

H = 0.2 T applied field to drive the Pb normal

Note excess conductance above T_c





Magnetic Evolution: T = 20mK; T << T_c



[001] & [100]: Coherence peaks move inward, evolving into another gap-like feature splitting

All splitting persist to highest measured field of 18 T; well above H_{c2} [110]: ZBCP decreases, then splits w/ increasing field (Effects start at lower field due to intrinsic pair breaking in this direction.) 58

Magnetic Evolution: T = 4K; T > Tc

Splittings grow even with T > T_c

LH Column (T < T_c) (from last slide)

RH Column (T > T_c)

 $(T_c = 2.3 \text{ K})$



Magnetic Evolution: T = 10 K and 15 K (T >> Tc)

No Field-Induced Gap "FIG" (high-field splitting) Above T = 5 K ~ T_p (preformed pairs)

Broad peak is only gradually suppressed with field: Insets show a small change up to 14 T (< 0.5%)



High-field splitting only appears when there are: preformed (T < Tp ~5 K) or coherent (T < Tc = 2.3K) Cooper pairs

Model of Composite Cooper Pairing

Cooperative Kondo screening via two channels in the same fcenter, so spin direction of Kondo scattering is correlated.



I. Summary Notes: Our CeCoIn₅ PTS data show

- 1. d_{x2-y2} pairing symmetry.
- 2. Preformed pairs exist at least to ~ 5 K (T_c = 2.3 K).
- 3. Increasing magnetic field suppresses the SC gap and induces a new gap persisting up to 18 T, the highest field measured (well above H_{c2}).
- 4. Smooth conductance field evolution from SC to field-induced gap.
- 5. There is no field-induced gap above preformed pair T \sim 5K
- 6. The field-induced gap grows linearly with field: Zeeman-like, just like the single-impurity Kondo effect (Anderson-Applebaum).
- The neutron spin-resonance seen in the tunneling in the cuprate and Fe-based SCs is NOT SEEN in any of the tunneling into CeCoIn₅.
 (see next slide...)



Summary II: Planar Tunneling Spectroscopy of CeCoIn₅

The neutron spin-resonance seen in the tunneling in the cuprate

and Fe-based SCs is **NOT SEEN** in any of the tunneling into CeCoIn₅.

In the **cuprates and Fe-based SCs**, the INS resonance at ~ 40 meV is spinexciton-like and is observed in STM. This is taken not only as a signature of the sign change of the order parameter, but since this spin-spin correlation peak is observed in the tunneling spectra, this exciton plays a major role in the Cooper pairing.

Yu Song et al measure the inelastic neutron scattering in Ce_{1-x} Yb _xColn₅ and find the resonance at 0.6 meV:

- a) This peak is robust against Yb doping (not Tc-dep);
- b) It is magnon-like, not spin-exciton-like in character

Robust upward dispersion of the neutron spin resonance in the heavy fermion superconductor Ce_{1-x}Yb_xCoIn₅

Yu Song, John Van Dyke, I. K. Lum, B. D. White, Sooyoung Jang, Duygu Yazici, L. Shu, A. Schneidewind, Petr Čermák, Y. Qiu, M. B. Maple, Dirk K. Morr 🏁 & Pengcheng Dai 🏁

Nature Communications 7, Article number: 12774 (2016) Download Citation ±



That this neutron resonance is not seen in any of the tunneling into CeCoIn₅ indicates it does mot play a major role in the Cooper pairing.

Conclusions: Our CeCoIn₅ PTS data show

Our temperature, magnetic field, and orientational dependent planar tunneling data (high-quality and reproducible), and considering other published data, our results are consistent with Cooper paring due to:

- Two Channel Kondo Scattering; and
- Composite d-wave pairing as <u>candidate</u> for the mechanism



Some Grand Challenges

- What are the different ways quantum matter* can order?
 *Largely unsolved; ~50 classes of non-Fermi liquids
- What are the potential uses of correlated and topological states of matter?
- Can quasiparticles be "engineered?"
- Overarching Theme: The 1st quantum revolution led to the notion of electrons and holes in semiconductors that fueled much of modern information technology. What new powerful ideas will come out of the 2nd quantum revolution that will help us create the next generation of quantum devices? Or:
 "The 1st quantum revolution: understanding and controlling the magnitude of the quantum

The 2nd quantum revolution is about controlling its phase"



Materials are the Future

All advances in the human condition are all based on advances in materials research. **We use materials to describe human progress – the bronze age, the iron age, and today silicon - have each ushered in new eras of expansion.** Today, advances in semiconductors power the digital world, novel materials are advancing batteries and energy storage, making carbon capture possible, new biologics improve health outcomes, and superconductors make MRI possible have promise to revolutionize our energy needs.

Many of the most important breakthrough discoveries in material science have been serendipitous – based on hunches from people who have had decades of experience, trying out new things, who seem to know "where to go" to find the next novel material. The breakthrough is followed by further incremental innovations to bring the discovery to reality.

It's worth adding, that for quantum detection and computation, we have not found the qubits that are both usable and scalable (cold atoms, superconductors):



We need fundamental materials research.